Siner-GI case studies: Objectives and methodology of comparative analysis

Gilles Allaire (INRA), Denis Sautier (CIRAD)
SINER GI

Strengthening International Research on Geographical Indications

www.origin-food.org

• UE funded project (2006-2008)
• Continuation of the Dolphins Project on European GI
• Siner-GI project addresses GI in the global market as a global issue
SINER-GI PROJECT OBJECTIVES

• To understand what are the conditions for successful GI qualification?
  – Not only stable and profitable position on the market
  – But positive impacts on local/national economic, social, health, environmental public issues

• To understand what are supporting policies and collective initiatives to this purpose?
  – Criteria for transferability of GIs good practices

• To address these issues considering several scenarios regarding the international trade regime
STEP 1: Case Studies

• Building up methodology (WP1-WP4)
  – The GI system is “the set of actors who are effectively engaged in creating value and improving the strategic marketing position of the GI product by spontaneous individual or organized collective action, and those who are engaged in the activation and reproduction of those local resources (natural resources, knowledge, social capital) which make the GI product specific”
  – Several dimensions of GI systems: the market structure, the supply chain organisation, the stakeholders and policies supports, the system management and governance, the technology and product qualification procedure…

• Inventory of GIs in a large set of countries
  ➢ database on our website (60 cases)

• Implementation of 12 case studies (June-October 2007)
Sampling strategy: legal and institutional framework

Limited protection
(repression of abuses)

Effective implementation

Florida oranges

Rooibos
South Africa

Limited implementation

Roquefort

Jin Hua ham

High level of protection
(attribution of rights)
Sampling strategy: 
*Market stakes and support policy*

**Stake:**
- Market restructuring
- Market enlargement

**Sectorial support:**
- Paprika
- Tequila

**Public support:**
- Pico Duarte coffee
- Pampean beef

*Market enlargement*
## STEP 1: Case Studies (result)
### Typology of GI systems

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recognition Policy</th>
<th>Rural development policy</th>
<th>Market strategic stake</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>P1: High and effective protection</strong></td>
<td>public or NGO support for Rural Dev.</td>
<td>Restructuring: Melton Mowbray pork Pie, Enlargement: Roquefort</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>sectorial support (firms)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>P2: High protection, limited or no implementation</strong></td>
<td>public or NGO support for rural dev.</td>
<td>Restructuring: Pico Duarte coffee, Kajmak cheese, Enlargement: Jinhua Ham, Pampean Beef, Blueberry Lac St. Jean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>sectorial support</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>P3: Protection through trademarks / effective</strong></td>
<td>public or NGO support for rural dev.</td>
<td>Restructuring: Florida oranges, Enlargement: Rooibos</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sectorial support</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>P4: Protection through trademark system: limited</strong></td>
<td>public or NGO support for rural dev.</td>
<td>Restructuring: Chontaleño cheese, Enlargement: Basmati rice (Pak.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>sectorial support</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Siner-GI Case studies and Legal situation of GIs in the world (2006)
To contrast different aspects and trends according to the new international trade regime, we consider three scenarios.

These scenarios concern the position of origin (GI) as a marketing tool in a complex global market universe in which private and public standards play an important role in the dynamics of markets:

- **CONVERGENCE** on GI visions and “origin” as integrator for different quality attributes (organic, fair trade...)
- **DIVERGENCE** on GI visions and “origin” weakening as market sign
- **PLURALITY** of GI visions and of quality schemes and forums
STEP3: Comparative Analysis Methodology

• Types of geopolitical contexts
  – Diversity of the protection schemes and support policies

• Types of GI systems/markets
  – Diversity of economic trajectories of the GI systems (success/failure)

• Variability of the impacts according to
  – the scenarios
  – the contexts
  – the GI systems